

NASIHATLAR OF ABBAS KULU AGHA BAKIKHANLI

Audrey L. ALTSTADT
(*University of Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*)

Nasihatlar (Admonitions) is a short work comprising laconic and simply stated moral "lessons" written for young people. It was composed by Abbas Kulu Agha Bakikhanli (1794-1846) [Bakikhanov in Russian sources] in 1836. Bakikhanli was an historian, philosopher, pedagogue and translator. His work Nasihatlar, like the author himself, has received only sporadic attention under Russian/Soviet rule and is virtually unknown in the West.

The present Chapter presents an examination of the work and the author, set in historical context, and includes a complete translation of Nasihatlar based on three recently published texts (in both Turkish and Russian). (1)

Nasihatlar, despite its brevity and long years of obscurity, is an important work in the history of Azerbaijan's cultural evolution. It is an articulation, in compact form, of a society's values ~ those values held in such high esteem that they were deemed essential to pass on to future generations by inculcating them from earliest childhood. Bakikhanli emphasized the use of intellect and rational thought, the acquisition of knowledge, honesty, justice and moderation in social relations.

Bakikhanli, in Nasihatlar, has left the earliest record of such moral admonitions of Azerbaijan (2) after the Russian conquest. They constitute a reassertion of societal values in the face of conquest by a power that shared neither language, history nor cultural traditions.

Bakikhanli's ideas are all the more-worthy of study because of the greater role he strove to play ~ and, unknown to himself, did play — in shaping the education of future generations of Azerbaijani Turks. He wrote extensively on education, both its moral foundations and practical execution. Nasihatlar is, in fact, distilled from the key arguments presented in Bakikhanli's treatise Moral Education (Tahzib

72 **Audrey L. ALTSTADT**

al-Ahlak), written 1832-33. Bakikhanli also wrote a detailed plan for establishing a school for local boys in Baku. (Both works will be discussed briefly below.)

Bakikhanli's school project, although not published in his lifetime, provided a model for other educators. The proposal in which he outlined the project was apparently usurped by tsarist bureaucrats, altered, and put into effect in a form that suited the needs of the tsarist system rather than the indigenous population. The plan served as the basis for more than seven decades of debate on education reform and even constituted the basis — again in distorted form — for Soviet-era education policy. Bakikhanli's legacy is thus imbedded in contemporary policy, which is itself an unwitting, silent tribute to his thought and work.

The focal point of the present chapter is, as noted, the translation and analysis of three published texts of Bakikhanli's Nasihatlar. The discussion begins with some remarks on Bakikhanli himself, the political and intellectual climate in which he wrote Nasihatlar, and the works in which he further elaborated those ideas expressed in Nasihatlar. These sections are followed by a comparison of the three published texts and of the messages contained therein. Parallels to other Central Asian works are considered. The chapter ends with a composite translation of the text based on the three published versions.

ABBAS KULU AGHA BAKIKHANLI

Bakikhanli was born on -21 June (3 July by the Gregorian calendar) 1794 in the village of Amirjan, just outside the town of Baku. He was the son of the khan of Baku, Mirza Muhammad Khan II. During the decade of his birth, the struggle for Caucasia between the expanding Russian Empire and the new Qajar dynasty in Iran was beginning. The Russian conquest would take place in the following decade. Mirza Muhammad Khan had apparently been unseated because of some regional conflict, and, as a result, went over to the

Russians. (3) His six sons subsequently entered Russian service, in the military or, like Abbas Kulu Agha, as translators. (4)

Bakikhanli entered Russian service in 1819-20, reportedly after 20 years of orthodox Islamic education in Shari'a, Persian and Arabic languages and literatures, Islamic texts. Since he served for most of the following 25 years as translator of Oriental Languages, however, he must have learned Russian as well. He acted as translator in Russian relations with Daghestan (Caucasia was still under direct military rule until 1840), in the negotiations with Iran of the Treaty of Turkmanchai (1828), in the demarcation of the Russo-Iranian border and other diplomatic assignments.

During his years in tsarist service, especially during a prolonged leave of absence in the 1830s, Bakikhanli also wrote numerous works of philosophy, history (including histories of Baku and Derbend), astronomy, mathematics, pedagogy — even a Persian grammar. He wrote many literary works including much poetry. He wrote most often in Persian and Arabic and apparently less in Turkish (in which he wrote a number of satirical pieces and poetry). The reason for this is given by Bakikhanli himself (5) - the spoken Turkish dialect of Azerbaijan (probably Bakikhanli's mother tongue) was at that time not used as a scholarly or literary language in Azerbaijan. The effort to establish the spoken Turkish vernacular (as opposed to Ottoman, which was then full of Persian and Arabic loans words and grammatical constructions) as a literary language in Azerbaijan was launched in Bakikhanli's lifetime by his countryman Mirza Fath Ali Akhonzade (1812-1878).

Between 1835 and 1842, Bakikhanli left active service, took up residence near Kuba and devoted himself primarily to his scholarship, although he apparently also wrote several reports for the local administration. (6) In 1837, he wrote a report on an uprising that year in Kuba against the Russian levy of local men for service in Warsaw. (7) Apparently, he protested the government's handling of the incident. (8)

In 1841, after years of research, Bakikhanli completed his history of Azerbaijan, Gulistan-i Iram (Garden of Paradise). He translated it

into Russian (from the original Persian) in 1842 under the title Istoriia vostochnoi chastii Kavkaza (History of the Eastern Caucasus).

After his recall to service, just as Caucasia was being placed under civil rather than military rule, Bakikhanli was asked to write a report on the political structure of the former khanates. This report explained the rights and privileges of the khans, described the national and tribal composition of the population and included other useful information. (9)

Bakikhanli made the hajj (to Mecca) in 1846. He died of cholera in the winter of 1846-47 (possibly in December 1846 or February 1847) in Arabia while returning. (10)

POLITICAL AND INTELLECTUAL CLIMATE

The 1830s, during which Bakikhanli wrote Nasihatlar, was a dynamic period in the history of Azerbaijan and the Russian Empire. Nicholas I was, in many respects, at the height of power. He had survived his succession crisis, putting down the Decembrists in 1825, and had suppressed the Polish

Rebellion in 1830-31. The Doctrine of Official Nationality, enshrining Autocracy, Orthodoxy and Nationality, was formulated and embraced in the mid 1830s. The dissident literary and political circles in St. Petersburg would be few and relatively powerless until the middle of the following decade.

In Europe, Nicholas' Russia represented the might of autocracy and stood as a bulwark against revolutionary change. It was a major guarantor of the Congress of Vienna and its hallowed principles of legitimacy and Great Power "balance." On the Asian fronts, the Empire's forces had defeated the Ottomans and Iran in the late 1820s. The Treaty of Turkmanchai (1828) had given the Russian Empire sweeping and intrusive privileges in Iran, including exemption of its subjects from Iranian law and of Russian goods from internal tariffs. The British would not gain similar privileges until 1841. (11) In short, this was a time of relatively free and overt exercise of Russian power in the political and cultural realm.

One of the few places which defied Russian power, however, was the Caucasus. Noteworthy for its violence and duration was the continuing resistance in the Caucasus Mountains led by Sheikh Shamil. This movement would not be subdued until the time of the Crimean War. In September 1837, Kuba, just south of Daghestan, briefly rose up to protest the levy of horsemen for duty in Warsaw. (12) Other types of resistance were also manifested. (13) Nonetheless, the tsarist government continued to press its policies in Caucasia.

There had been numerous administrative changes in Caucasia (officially the "Transcaucasian krai" [region]) such as adjustments of boundaries and appointments of former khans to govern them in the name of the Russian administration in Tiflis. Bakikhanli's own father had been given the administration of several settlements in the new Kuba province in 1824. (14)

Early in the 1830s, some within official circles had decided that Caucasia ought to be placed under civilian rule, that is, to undergo direct administrative incorporation into the Empire. One commission, under Senators P. I. Kutaisov and E. I. Mechnikov suggested that the Transcaucasian krai could be put to best use by "forcing the residents there to speak, think and feel in Russian [po-russkii] - lit: "Russianlike"]. Their plan included the idea of "illuminating the residents of the region with the rays of the Orthodox faith and establishing the living cross on the ruins of Islam." (15)

The Doctrine of Official Nationality reinforced and gave official legitimation to this colonial policy of Russification and Christianization. The goals were often pursued simultaneously. Missionaries, for example, established schools to teach both Christianity and Russian language. Missionary work continued throughout the period of tsarist rule, (16) but it had virtually no success.

Slightly more successful was the system of "Russian-native" schools which would dot Central Asia (17) by the turn of the next century. The first so-called "Russian-Tatar" (18) schools in the eastern provinces of Caucasia (present-day Azerbaijan SSR) were created in

the early 1830s: 1830 in Shusha, 1831 in Nukha, 1832 in Baku, 1833 in Ganje and then in 1837 in Shemakhi and Nakhjavan. (19)

These schools introduced Russian language and used it as the language of instruction for more than half the courses — mathematics, accounting, history, geography and Russian law. Their object was to train Azerbaijani Turks for careers in the civil bureaucracy or even the military. Although no indigenous students completed the course of instruction during the first 20 years of these schools' existence (20), they were funded and supported by the state and they did proliferate. (21)

In the face of these threats to traditional culture and values, Bakikhanli's moral Admonitions seem no less an act of defiance than his protest of the official handling of the 1837 Kuba uprising. (22)

Indeed, Nasihatlar represents a more fundamental protest than that against one isolated incident because that small book constitutes an attack upon a policy and a mode of thought. It strives to defend Azerbaijani Turks from a powerful regime's zealous efforts to Russify and Christianize.

The ideas expressed in Nasihatlar are more fully elaborated in Bakikhanli's Tahzib al-Ahlak and in his plan for the establishment of a school for local children under his own direction. Both works were written the same year the first Russian-Tatar school opened in Baku. It is helpful to look briefly at the main points of these before turning to Nasihatlar.

BAKIKHANLI'S TAHZIB AL-AHLAK ("MORAL EDUCATION ") AND SCHOOL PROJECT

Tahzib al-Ahlak comprises twelve chapters, an introduction ("Philosophy") and a conclusion ("On the Secrets of Enlightenment"). Among the twelve chapters are "Observance of Moderation" (Chapter I), "On the Excellence of Good Works," (Chapter II), "On the Rules of Social Intercourse," (Chapter VIII, the longest), On the Principles of Humility," (Chapter IX), "On the Extolling of Conscientiousness," (Chapter X) and "On the Advantages of Being Satisfied with Little"

(Chapter XI). This treatise constitutes the full elaboration of the ideas embodied in the laconic Nasihatlar.

This treatise, like Nasihatlar, emphasizes the importance of rational thought. The Introduction, titled "Philosophy," bears the same message as the introductory passage to Nasihatlar - that humans can think and choose, a facility that distinguishes humankind from lower animals. Without rational inquiry, Bakikhanli adds in Tahzib al-Ahlak, one cannot choose or decide on a course of action. (23) Throughout this work, Bakikhanli emphasizes the importance of human choice, the use of one's intellect, and truthfulness. As in Nasihatlar, he discusses the importance of friendship, urges caution toward enemies, and warns against bad company. He extols the virtue of listening more than talking, of being content with few material possessions, of self control and self examination, and the need to improve one's self by application of conscientiousness and moral principles.

Bakikhanli's "Project for the Establishment of a Muslim School," was presented to the High Commissioner (glavnoupravliaiushchii) of Caucasia Baron Rosen on 20 February 1832. (24)

Bakikhanli's project reflects both his understanding of the need to appeal to the government and his own goals to educate Azerbaijani Turks. He begins with obligatory statement of the benign objective of the empire which has "taken the Transcaucasian region under its protection..." He follows this with several reasons why the education of the newly acquired population is in the interest of the empire:

...it is impossible to attach people to yourself by superfluous condescension and rewards, if in them [the people] there is no attachment to the order of things which is being introduced. Although personal profit may attract them at some times, still there is no doubt, that at the first appearance of [appropriate] circumstances, they will wholeheartedly return to their former way of thinking... the more widely education is disseminated among them, the more the government will acquire people well disposed (toward it), who will facilitate the spread among the populace of the benevolent intentions of the government concerning the general welfare... [and] their

prosperity... [will] serve in Asia as an eternal monument of the glory of the great Russian monarch."

In his justification for this project, as in Nasihatlar, Bakikhanli sounds the theme of intellect and understanding. He notes that the local people "suppose that chance or fate elevated Europe and gave it that strength or might by means of which it acquired unchallenged primacy." Education, he states, will be the key to improved social conditions and general contentment of the populace.

As for the proposal itself, it comprises eleven detailed items discussing the intended location of the school (Baku), students and their living conditions, course of study, teachers, guards and servants (for those resident at the school), books and other supplies, and even a discussion of what the students may do upon completion of the three-year program.

An important part of Bakikhanli's plan, essential components of which reappeared over the ensuing decades without any attribution to him, was the bilingual feature of the project. Students were to be taught by native and Russian teachers in relevant languages and courses of study.

RECENT TRANSLATIONS OF NASIHATLAR

In 1982 and 1983, two separate editions of Nasihatlar (in three languages and three scripts) were published in Baku. One, published in 1982, is a "popular" publication in a pocket-size, paperback edition, published in 30,000 copies and costing 20 kopeks. It contains three copies of Nasihatlar: two are in Azerbaijani Turkish (one in Cyrillic, one Arabo-Persian script) and one is in Persian. (25) The other volume, published in 1983, is a publication of the Academy of Sciences of the Azerbaijan SSR which includes a biography of Bakikhanli and many of his major works and correspondence in Russian translation. (26) This volume is hardback volume of more than 340 pages, published in 4000 copies and costs 3 rubles.

The translation at the end of the Chapter is based on the two Turkic and one Russian versions in these volumes. The versions differ

in both wording and in substance. The discrepancies begin even with their introductions.

In his brief introduction to the 1982 volume (with Persian and two Turkic texts), Memmedaga Sultanov states that Bakikhanli wrote the work in both these languages. He gives no other information on the manuscript and incorrectly reports the date of composition as 1254 A.H. rather than 1252, which is the date given in the text itself.

According to an explanatory note accompanying the Azerbaijan Academy of Sciences' Russian translation of 1983, Nasihatlar was written in Persian and translated into Turkish by an unknown author. A Persian-language manuscript from 1838-39 (1254 A. H.) reportedly exists in the Azerbaijan Academy of Sciences Manuscript Collection.

A more important discrepancy exists between the two translations - the 1982 Turkish and Persian variants have only 88 items. The Russian translation contains 103 - the 88 items in the Turkish version and 19 additional items. Neither the present writer nor, to my knowledge, other non-Soviet scholars, have ever had access to the original manuscript. Therefore, there is no independent verification concerning the actual number of Admonitions or original language(s) of the work. All published texts, however, number each Admonition. References to specific items in the following discussion therefore have two numbers ~ the first number, from the Russian translation, followed by a number in brackets representing the item number in the Turkish translation. When the Turkish translation has no corresponding item, the first number stands alone.

The Russian-language translation produced by the Academy of Sciences, however, appears to be the more accurate for reasons to be discussed below.

DIFFERENCES IN TEXTS

A. Differences between two Turkic versions, in Cyrillic (Cy) and Arabo-Persian (AP) script.

The Turkish Cyrillic text is not, as one might expect, a transcription of the Arabo-Persian. Rather, nearly every Nasihat has



some difference in phrasing or word choice, however minor. The differences in many instances do not reflect a readily discernible pattern. That is to say neither transcription contains a consistently more Turkic or more Arabic and Persian vocabulary. The Cyrillic transcription does seem to use language that, for the most part, conforms to common spoken usage (often Turkish rather than Persian or Arabic words) of Soviet Azerbaijani Turks: in Item 55 [42], Cy uses "kul" rather than "bende" in AP; in Item 62 [47] uses the more common "yerine yetermek" instead of "icra etmek"; in Item 75 [60] Cy has "pis hasiyyet" instead of "badmizac"; in Item 81 [66] Cy uses "kin" instead of "adavet"; Item 85 [70] Cy uses "pis ad" where AP has "badnamelik."

Rarely the reverse is true, i.e. that AP contains terms more common in Soviet Azerbaijan: Item 24 [9] AP ends with the phrase "senin hakkinda pis fikre duser" and Cy ends with the more bookish (and Persian) "senin hakkinda badguman olar."

There are some differences in content in which the Cy transcription omits some words or whole sentences (Items 14 [1], 39 [24], 46 [31], 55 [42], 80 [65], 87 [72], 95 [78]), or gives a different message (Items 31 [16], 96 [79]) These are relatively few items, and the great majority of items, despite different wording, convey the same message. Much greater, however, are the discrepancies between Russian translation and either of the Turkish transcriptions, although the Russian is often closer to the Arabo-Persian than to the Cyrillic. (More on content differences in following section.)

In attempting to offer explanations for these differences, one must be prepared to accept not a single, all-encompassing motivation or "plan," but rather several "pulls" in different directions to account for various discrepancies. Some influences would conform to official censorship or agitprop guidelines and others, on the contrary, seem designed to promote some other goal.

Some changes of vocabulary between the Turkic texts could be sloppiness, as suggested by several obvious errors in typesetting and other simple mistakes in the book itself (e.g. the compiler dates the work as 1254 A.H., although Bakikhanli's introduction gives the date

as 1252. (27) The inconsistencies are too pervasive, however, for all to be accounted for with this excuse.

The discrepancies may reflect an attempt to alter the text to conform to present-day usage either for sake of convenience for contemporary readers, which would be supported by the frequent similarity between AP and Ru texts. The changes might have been introduced to suggest (to those who can only read the Cyrillic) that the present-day language was precisely the same that Bakikhanli used. The former might be a goal of those (perhaps on the production staff) interested in communicating the message of the Admonitions; the latter would support official language policy which claims the distinctness ~ and separateness — of an "Azerbaijani language" apart from other Turkic dialects.

Creating deliberate differences between the two Turkish versions could also serve as an obstacle to those who might try *to use this* book's parallel texts to learn the Arabo-Persian script (knowledge which the official apparatus would presumably prefer remain the domain of scholars) (28). But the technique could also be used by compilers or other participants in the production process to introduce synonyms and thereby expand vocabulary under the guise of trying to obstruct learning of the Arabo-Persian script. Elements of all the "strategies" suggested here may be operating for a complex "tradeoff."

Certain discrepancies in vocabulary can easily be construed (which is not to claim these are necessarily true) to serve specific, known goals. These might be gleaned from comparison of Cyrillic Turkish with both Arabo-Persian text and the apparently more scholarly Russian-language translation from original manuscripts: Only Cy Item 14 [1] lists "sister" as an object of respect, which would militate toward breaking the traditional male-dominated family hierarchy. On the other hand, only in the Cyrillic text does Item 31 [16] state that "if you remain unmarried" you are useless. The implication of the need to "be fruitful and multiply" is hardly Moscow's message to the Central Asians, but is a possible message

within Azerbaijani Turkish society, especially for urbanites with their smaller families. (29)

B. Differences between Russian and Turkish Translations Most obvious in comparing the Russian translation to the two Turkic texts is the discrepancy in the number of Nasihatlar - a difference of 19 items. Two possibilities must be considered. On the one hand, the extra items may be apocryphal and were invented and inserted into the text in what must be called a bold — and quite uncharacteristic ~ move on the part of several senior, highly respected and widely published members of the Azerbaijan Academy of Sciences.

One can reasonably dismiss this highly unlikely possibility. Not that the Soviet establishment has not made appropriate "refinements" in translations of historical materials — indeed they are as famous for it as for the retouched photograph — but those changes are made to support the regime's official positions. (30) In the case of the 15 "missing" Admonitions, the opposite is true. Those items bear a message that is contrary to Soviet propaganda.

At the most obvious level, many of the 19 Admonitions in question contain religious messages. These messages would not have been sanctioned by the regime. (Even the most Machiavellian thinker could not risk a scheme involving "planting" a religious message to show its evil. It might backfire and instill real religiosity.) The individual members of a republican academy would be unlikely to manufacture their own religious message for they would have a great deal at stake and be unlikely to dare so easily discovered a charade. Furthermore, there is no reason to think that the scholars involved in the production of this volume are inclined to insert a view that runs against the grain of Soviet propaganda from the time of the Bolshevik Revolution. If they or anyone were so inclined, the risks would be too great, especially for a volume that would be published in only 4000 copies.

We are left then with the conclusion that the 19 Admonitions in the Russian translation are authentic and were omitted from the

Turkish translations. The more subtle, perhaps more powerful, content of these items is discussed below.

The careful and accurate historical notes, the phrasing of the Russian translation itself (Bakikhanli's reference to himself as "your servant" rather than as "I," for example), the attention to detail and the broad coverage of Bakikhanli's works of the Russian-language volume, combined with the credentials of the compiler and editorial board, further support the impression that the Academy's is the more serious and scholarly of the two volumes.

The alterations of the Turkish translations must therefore be seen as part of the agitprop function of that volume, especially in view of its large tiraj (30,000), low cost, and multiple language and dual-script text. It seems designed to deliver a certain message (and not deliver certain others) to a wide audience, reading in both Cyrillic and Arabo-Persian script and in Turkish and Persian. Such an audience would be found on both sides of the Soviet-Iranian border that divides Azerbaijan.

MESSAGE OF THE NASIHATLAR

Despite the differences in the various texts, all published versions share many common ideas and Admonitions. The text must speak for itself, but major points are discussed in the present section.

The single most powerful, insistent message of Nasihatlar is the centrality and power of knowledge, learning, and the use of intellect. This message is delivered more completely in the Russian translation, and will be discussed below. Both versions, however, contain numerous admonitions urging the acquisition of knowledge and the use of the mind over the heart: Ru Item 32 [Tk no. 17] on the primacy of intelligence; or Item 60 [45] in which the Turkish translations state there is no greater wealth than "intelligence and aspiration," while the Russian translation lists "mind and knowledge." -

Nasihatlar also emphasizes religious duties (also developed more fully in the Russian translation) and various aspects of moral behavior:

Audrey L. ALTSTADT

- be busy and avoid Uiziness; do not mix in business that is not your own (e.g., 29 [14], 30 [15], 31 [16]);
 - know and fulfill obligations (e.g., 5, 7, 11, 12, 98, 99 [81], 101 [83])
 - do not spread word of faults or errors of others nor expose your own faults for others to see (e.g., 24 [9], 26 [11], 38 [23], 41 [26], 66 [51]);
 - act with moderation, caution and discretion, neither speaking too much nor too openly, refraining from action when angry and avoiding vengeance (e.g., 27 [12], 28 [13], 35 [20] - 38 [23], 50 [35], 51 [36], 65 [50], 69 [54], 78 [63], 81 [66], 89 [74], 94 [77]);
 - deal honestly in all undertakings, keep your promises; unless there is contrary evidence, construe the actions of others in a positive way; yet give punishment when it is deserved (e.g., 61 [46], 62 [47], 67 [52] - 72 [57], 95 [78], 96 [79]);
 - to some degree, the individual must be a guarantor of justice, even ensuring that the guilty are punished and that the innocent exonerated (e.g., 95 [78], 96 [79], 102 [84]);
 - good friends are valuable ~ treat them and your relatives kindly, but do not associate with immoral people (e.g., 22 [7], 52 [37], 53 [38], 73 [58], 74 [59], 75 [60]);
 - be self-knowing and self-confident, not believing rumors or compliments nor being envious (e.g., 34 [19], 43 [28], 44 [29], 77 [62], 81 [66], 82 [67], 93 [76]);
 - spend wealth wisely, and do not be miserly nor run after material goods; do not become too attached to worldly riches because they will ultimately be lost; do not indulge your senses or the biddings of your heart (e.g., 54 [39], 58 [43], 59 [44], 83 [68], 84 [69], 87 [72], 88 [73]);
 - respect law, authorities and elders (although nothing in the language or full context suggests subservience): 4, 5, 6, 14 [1], 15 [2], 16, 17 [3], 18 [4]).
- The issues which are not included are also worthy of note. Nasihatlar is primarily a guide to appropriate ethical and moral social behavior. Religious precepts are presented as the foundation for ethics

and morality, in such Items as 1-13, but religious issues are not raised. There is no theme of religion vs state or of the conflicts between this-worldly and other-worldly concerns. There is no word about the renunciation of the world (merely a warning not become too attached to its riches, Item 87 [72]) nor mention of the cleansing power of solitude, fasting or celibacy. (31)

Differences in the Message of Russian Text

Most of the elements that distinguish the Russian text from the two in Turkish are embodied in Bakikhanli's introduction and the 19 items of the Russian translation that do not appear in the Turkish translations; secondarily are several major differences in those items that do exist in both translations, as marked in the translation below. Most obvious is that the first 13 Admonitions of the Russian translation (which do not occur in the Turkish versions) concern religious beliefs and obligations — the declaration that a world so ordered and harmonious must be the creation of a Supreme Being; the admonition to pray, give alms, revere the Prophets and follow the ulema; the doctrine of a Last Judgment with reward or punishment for the behavior of a lifetime.

Since this religious message was apparently deliberately omitted from the "popularized" Turkish and Persian publication, it must have been deemed powerful by the censors, or compilers engaging in self-censorship based on known guidelines. (32) Certainly, these items contain language that the Soviet citizen would rarely read in official publications (33) and might, for that very reason, exert even greater impact.

The first 13 items lay out the duties of a Muslim, especially (in the mention of the 12th imam as Mahdi) the Shi'a, and establish a religious basis

for morality in general. These and later items missing from the Turkish translations convey the idea that the world or nature and human society are governed by Divine law, that God assigned duties to human beings as would an earthly father (Item 2), that the law ("Shari'a") of the Prophets is legitimate, and that humans are

86

Audrey L. ALTSTADT

inherently unequal (Item 91) because they are not identical and were created for their own individual functions. Although, it must be reiterated that the religious elements are confined primarily to providing an underpinning for ethics and morality (and are dispensed with in the first 13 items), they do articulate ideas which the regime's antireligious propaganda has long sought to combat.

Turning to the main message, it is articulated unambiguously in the extra Nasihatlar and in Bakikhanli's brief introduction. It is a message whose power is perhaps more threatening than religion to the Soviet regime, whose roots in Turkic thought long antedate the Russian rise to political power and even the Turks' acceptance of Islam. It is a message whose appeal may seduce religious and irreligious alike including the young generations reared on "scientific socialism." It is, in fact, a message that is impossible to combat within the framework of Marxism-Leninism. The message is the power of knowledge and rational thought.

The first statement of this message precedes even the first Nasihat and is found in Bakikhanli's brief introduction addressed to the youth. This introduction sets the framework within which the Admonitions are given and establishes the central reason for passing them on to future generations. Here in this introduction the Turkish translation betrays a disconnectedness and illogic that suggests one of the famous Soviet "refinements" of historical texts:

"Don't you see that even though animals have such huge bodies and strength, still they are captive in the hands of man. And here is one of the reasons to do your work well. Those who are very knowledgeable and able are always respected.... it is always necessary to learn from those people..."

By contrast, in the Russian-language translation, the sentences logically follow one another and deliver a rather different message:

"Do you not see that strong and large animals are humble in the hands of a human being? This is thanks to the knowledge of the order of things. In society, too, whoever best knows his own affairs and does good, he will always be respected. Consequently, it is necessary

to learn the means of the knowledge of things and of the virtue of people..."

The former message is one of subordination to those who have greater experience, to figures of authority, in short, all those who "know better." The latter message states that it is knowledge "of the order of things" which, first, sets humanity above the animals and, second, makes one capable and respected in society, that is, as a social animal. Bakikhanli's Nasihatlar thus constitutes a non-Marxist source of humanitarian ethics, morals and exhortation to rationality. Therein lies this work's greatest threat to the regime for it is in the realm of social justice and change — in creating the perfect communist man ~ that Marxism-Leninism admits no competitors.

Carrying the point further, one need look only to the first Nasihat: "...there exists one God who created everything. We must know Him." The message is to know God, not to worship blindly. Prayer (Nasihat 11) is essential to this knowledge and understanding, it is not advocated merely for the sake of tradition or to supplicate for one's needs. There is no message of

subservience connected with knowing God, prayer, or even in urgings of respect for the ulema.

Also controversial is Item 92 which does not exist in any form in the Turkish translations: "...as people are distinguished by their [external] figure and voice, [they] are distinguished also by their knowledge and morals." Because this item is coupled with a previous Admonition (Item 91) which states that "All people cannot be equal,..." Item 92 seems to elaborate on that point and may therefore be construed as contrary to certain perceptions of egalitarianism.

INTELLECTUAL ANTECEDENTS

Whether consciously or not Bakikhanli's message carries on an earlier Turkic tradition, both Turko-Islamic and pre-Islamic Turkic. This is not to deny his conscious intellectual debt to those whom he quotes in his works including Sufi poets like Sana'i, Hafiz and Rumi. Rather the object here is to demonstrate two basic points: (1) the emphasis on the use of intellect and rational thought, associated in the

West with the Enlightenment, has never been the exclusive preserve of Western thought. Bakikhanli need not have learned such ideas from European writers to whom, in any case, he never refers; (2) Bakikhanli's works carry on a tradition that exists not only in Islamic tradition, but one that is older than Islam and which is consciously used as a precedent by later generations of Azerbaijani Turks.

Kutadgu Bilig, written in 1069 in Kashgar by Balasagunlu Yusuf, known as Yusuf Khass Hajib, is a Turkic "mirror for princes" of the Islamic period. This work, of just over 6600 lines, contains many Turkic themes and motifs which distinguish it from Irano-Islamic works of the same century, which were written after Yusuf's work. (34)

Kutadgu Bilig emphasizes intelligence and wisdom as well as religion as the basis for morality and just rule. Indeed, one of the four central figures of Kutadgu Bilig represents Wisdom. Many themes which characterize Nasihatlar occupy a central place in Kutadgu Bilig.

Chapter 6 of Kutadgu Bilig is titled "That man's chief glory is wisdom and intellect," and states "When God created man He chose him and distinguished him, granting him virtue and wisdom, mind and understanding..." (Line 148-150). Later, we read "What is there in the world more precious than wisdom? To call a man a fool is an ugly curse... if a wise man has a seat in the courtyard, then the courtyard is superior to the seat of honor" (Line 260-2); and "Use your intellect in the execution of all your affairs" (Line 5194; compare these to Nasihatlar 32 [17], 60 [45]).

Most of all like Bakikhanli's words on intellect is this passage: "It is out of intellect that all good things proceed, and it is through wisdom that a man achieves greatness. With both together a man ennobles himself... What is greater than wisdom? That it is which distinguishes man from beast." (Lines 1841-43; Compare to Introduction to Nasihatlar) (35)

Balasagunlu Yusuf also emphasizes the permanence of a good name: "The living die in the end and make the earth their bed, but if a man dies and he is good, his name lives on" (Line 237; see Nasihatlar

50 [35], 85 [70]); "...if I die with a good name, I shall have no cause for repentance." (Line 920) (36)

Kutadgu Bilig cautions against anger and acting in anger: "Good man of intellect, put off anger... If you rush into an affair [when angry]..., you will surely ruin your life. He who gets angry always regrets his deed, and he who gets annoyed at a task always errs... Self-control and moderation are required along with reason and good sense in order to distinguish men and to conduct business." (Lines 322-28) "Restrain your temper: when anger overcomes you, pretend you are tongue-tied." (Line 5216; see Nasihatlar 28 [13], 81 [66])

Kutadgu Bilig notes the importance of friends: "Know that friends are like another back: if a man had many friends his back rests against a mountain cliff; and a man who has a strong backing is firmly rooted in Fortune" (Line 1698; compare to Nasihat 53 [38]); the dangers of associating with those of bad character: "Stay away from the one who has a bad reputation... Do not mix with the bad man, good man, or you'll become bad like him" (Lines 4280-40); "Do not mix with the wicked, but stay clear of them" (Line 4290); "Do not consort with wicked friends; they will bring you loss..." (Line 1296; compare these with Nasihatlar 22 [7], 75 [60]).

On the treatment of friends and enemies, Yusuf's work again seems to foreshadow Bakikhanli's: "If you would make your enemy your servant, offer him abundant gold and honor his beard. If you would estrange an intimate, speak harshly to him and do not give him what he asks" (Line 4277; compare to Nasihat 57 [42]); "If you wish all men to love you, make your heart and your tongue one and your words sweet" (Line 4278 compare to Nasihat 52 [37]).

Also in Kutadgu Bilig are instructions concerning respect for and conduct toward descendants of the Prophet and the ulema (Lines 4336-4355; Nasihat 4,6,16), to avoid envy (Line 1302; see Nasihat 43 [28], 44 [29]), to guard your tongue (Lines 1313, 3425; see Nasihat 19 [5], 71 [56]), and the advantage of providing moral education to children: "Instruct your child in wisdom while he is young and he will be successful... Whatever a child learns in youth he does not forget in

old age but retains until he dies" (Line 1495; compare to Bakikhanli's Introduction to Nasihatlar).

In comparing of the message of Kutadgu Bilig to that of Nasihatlar, two points must be noted. First, seem to be no direct references to Kutadgu Bilig in Bakikhanli's published works. The number and detail of the similarities between the messages of the two works are striking, however. Second, it must be noted that the such similarities would not be found in examining other known "mirror for princes" works. The other works of this genre written later in the 11th century, the Persian Qabus-nameh and Nizam al-Mulk's Siyaset-nameh or the 12th c. Nasihat al-Muluk by al-Ghazali have distinct characteristics, all unlike Kutadgu Bilig in their main thrust. Qabus-nameh emphasizes the pursuit of pleasure, Siyaset-nameh is an administrative handbook, and Nasihat al-Muluk strives "to establish the ethnical and religious basis of the sultanate." (37) The best known Western work of this genre, Machiavelli's The Prince, is, of course, of an entirely different spirit.

That much of the tradition which Nasihatlar embody is indeed Turkic (rather than "Islamic") is attested not only by comparison among the above-mentioned works or the relative lack of emphasis on religious questions in Nasihatlar, but also by a brief examination of the pre-Islamic Turkic inscriptions of the Orkhon tablets, erected in the 8th century.

The Orkhon Tablets, comprising five stone monuments with inscriptions on all sides, are located in present-day Mongolia. They tell of early Turkic rulers, wars and statesmen. Several clear messages, similar to those of Bakikhanli's Nasihatlar, are articulated in the inscriptions on these monuments or are implicit in their heroic narrative. (38)

The longest inscription is the Kul Tigin inscription which warns the Turks of the "soft materials" with which the Chinese, their remote neighbors and enemies, may lull and deceive them. The inscription warns of the Turks thinking of being satiated and of living in close proximity to the Chinese. (S 5-8, E 8-40) (39) In the past, Turks were taken in by the Chinese "wiles and deceptions," betrayed their kagans

(rulers) and thereby fell under Chinese rule: "Their softs worthy of becoming lords became slaves and their daughters worthy of becoming ladies became servants to the Chinese people." (E7)

When the Turks fell under this spell, thousands were killed. The inscription states that if the Turks themselves had not erred, no outside force could have subdued or destroyed them: "If the sky did not collapse, and if the earth below did not give way, O Turkish people, who would be able to destroy your state and institutions? O Turkish people regret and repent! Because of your unruliness, you yourselves betrayed your wise kagan who had (always) nourished you, and you yourselves betrayed your realm which was free and independent, and you (yourselves) caused discord." (E 22-23)

The implicit message is that the individuals and the community are responsible for their own actions and their own fate - no "scourge of God" is blamed for the loss of independence. The Turks are themselves blamed for being taken in by seductive material comforts. Their ruin was a result of their poor judgment, foolishness, betrayal of their own just rulers, failure to exercise caution, and lack of self-control.

Other inscriptions emphasize the importance of strength and action rather than inaction or laziness (Bilga Kagan and Tonyukuk inscriptions), the importance of taking responsibility (the Ongin inscription) and the glorification of a wise and brave leader (Kulu Cor inscription).

As suggested above, it is not known whether Bakikhanli had ever read Kutadgu Bilig, although there are many similarities and the work was known in his time. The Orkhon tablets, on the other hand, were apparently not known in Bakikhanli's lifetime. (40) The point to be made here is not Bakikhanli's consciousness of the precedent, but the fact that his work represents a continuation of an earlier Turkic tradition. Bakikhanli seems to echo the messages of Kutadgu Bilig nearly eight centuries after Yusuf Khass Hajib and to bear the spirit of the Orkhon tablets 1200 years after they were inscribed.

BAKIKHANLI'S IMPACT

The impact of *Nasihatlar* lies not in its originality, for the ideas it expresses are not original. Rather, this work and others by Bakikhanli are influential because they provide a link to the intellectual, social, cultural past; indeed they reassert seminal traditional values.

For works to have impact, they must be known. Evidence indicates that Bakikhanli's works were known, although rarely in published form.

Apparently, only one volume by Bakikhanli was published before 1920. (41) *Nasihatlar* was not published until the 1925, in a larger volume on literary history. (42) Bakikhanli's school project was first published in 1957 and *Tahzib al-Ahlak* was published for the first time in 1982. Frequent mention of his name and ideas in the periodical press of the late imperial period, however, raise the possibility that his works circulated in manuscript or may have been published in periodicals or volumes under names other than Bakikhanli's. The publication of *Nasihatlar* by Firudin Kocherli in 1925 (cited above) demonstrate that at least some manuscripts were in the hands on Azerbaijan's intellectual elite.

The impact of Bakikhanli's ideas were left without always being associated with his name and efforts. His bilingual school project reappeared in modified form as the so-called Khanykov plan in 1845. (43) The basis had, however, been radically altered. No longer was the aim of bilingual education and "mixed" (44) curriculum to provide access to two worlds, but it was now to prevent Azerbaijani Turks from going to Iran or the Ottoman Empire for a potentially "subversive" or "anti-Russian" education and "to train students in accord with the wishes of the state." (45)

The Bakikhanli Project appeared yet again in the "First Muslim Teachers' Conference" in Baku in 1906 and in the plan of that Conference's Planning Committee, which worked out a detailed program for bilingual education and "mixed" curriculum. (46) Although no conscious link to Bakikhanli's project has yet been

documented, the 1906 Teachers' Committee's plan calls for many of the same provisions as Bakikhanli's plan of 70 years earlier.

Perhaps most telling of all is the revival of interest in Bakikhanli and the reprinting - or in some cases first publication - of his works in the 1980s. The message of Nasihatlar is now, 150 years after its composition, deemed potent enough to warrant publication in Persian and Turkish in 30,000 copies, undoubtedly for distribution in both Soviet and Iranian Azerbaijan. It is also considered sufficiently powerful to require considerable alteration. The scholars of the Azerbaijan SSR Academy of Sciences, too, have testified to Bakikhanli's continuing relevance in their production of a carefully translated and documented volume of his writings. Preparations are reportedly being made for the commemoration, in 1994, of the 200th anniversary of his birth, to which this Chapter is dedicated.

COMPOSITE TEXT OF ABBAS KULU AGA BAKIKHANLI'S NASIHATLAR

NOTE: In the following translation, most items have two numbers. The first corresponds to the number of the Russian-language translation (by the Academy of Sciences). It is followed by the item's number from the Turkish translations unless there is no corresponding item.

The first 13 items of the Russian translation, for example, do not exist in the Turkish translation and have only one number. Nasihat No. 1 in the Turkish translation, however, corresponds to Nasihat no. 14 of the Russian; that item is marked 14 [1]. Differences between Cyrillic [Cy] and Arabo-Persian [AP] scripts are noted in brackets [] as are differences with the Russian [Ru] translation. When the two Turkic texts are the same, the abbreviation "Tk" has been used.

Transliteration (in comments): The Latin script as in Modern Turkish is used, without diacritics so "sh" sound and "s" both appear
3S s.

Nasihatlar

In the name of God, the Merciful, the Compassionate! Praise to God, lord of the world. Blessings to Muhammad, most revered among people, first and last; blessing and greetings to his blameless and immaculate descendants!

Abbasgulu ibn merhum (son of the late) Mirza Mehemmed khan Bakuvi, under the Pseudonym Kudsi, (47) speaks thus: when your humble servant was informed and became versed in the condition of knowledge, [he] discovered that, after finishing the Koran students set about [reading] several books with words incomprehensible to them that even their teachers themselves cannot understand, and in several works, the issues are so diffuse and dissipated that understanding and remembering them turns out to be difficult.

[Turkic versions begin with elipsis followed by these words: When I became aware of knowledge, it became known to me that children, when

they want to learn from certain books, encounter such confused turns of speech that even their teachers...]

Therefore, it follows from the thought (of the aphorism): 'Knowledge learned in childhood is like an image cut in stone,' that the beauty of morals must be taught in childhood more than in other years. After bad morals are rooted in one's nature, thanks to repetition and habit, knowledge and principles of intercourse influence them only with difficulty.

[Turkic version: Because of this, it seems they are ignorant of the content of this aphorism... It is necessary in childhood more than at any other time to teach the beauty of morality. During the repetition of excellent morals, this becomes a custom and part of human nature and scholarly and literary rules that are difficult to learn become a habit.]

Thus, in the one thousand two hundred fifty second year of the Hijra, I set forth in understandable phrases and content a short essay of admonitions by the name, "A Book of Admonitions."

I hope it will aid the munificent threshold [of God] (48), that children will get some use out of it and will approach it with enthusiasm.

[Turkic version differs here only slightly: I wrote a clear and easily understood short book by the name Nasihatlar (Admonitions) ... and I hope that this work will be of use to children and will influence the gradual development of their upbringing.]

I am directing advise to children thus:

My dear beloved (esteemed), you are a human being. God created man above everything else! Do you not see that even though animals have such huge bodies and strength, still they are captive in the hands of man. And this is thanks to the knowledge of the order of things. In society too, whoever best knows his own affairs and does good, he will always be respected. Consequently, it is necessary to learn the means of the knowledge of things and of the virtue of people, who through examination and experience delineate what is good and what is bad, and the words which for us are admonitions.

[Tk versions ends thus after "captive in the hands of man": But this is one of the reasons for doing your work well. Respect those who are very knowledgeable (bilikli) and able (isbilen). In other words, it is always necessary to learn from those people the rules of managing your own affairs (is bilmek: task, job) and doing good; they [are the ones who] are experienced in life and [possess] talent. The words of such people advise us:]

1. A world with such foundations and order could not be without a sovereign. That means that there exists one God who created everything. We must know him.
2. If a father does not leave his own children on their own and [rather] to each designates a certain duty, then how is it possible that supreme God created us in vain and would not have entrusted us with certain duties?

96 _____ Audrey L. ALTSTADT

3. We never see God, consequently, we need a person who can transmit to us the word of and duties to God through the angels. We call such a person a prophet.
4. There have been many prophets; [and] all were true. But in as much as everything has its own time, today Almighty God deigned the Shari'a of our prophet, the Messenger of God, Muhammad ibn Abdallah (blessings be upon him), [be considered] better than the Shari'a [sic - laws] of other prophets and [He] guided [us?] to submit to it.
5. The commands and duties which Almighty God hands down to us through the Prophet is the Koran, which is from beginning to end the word of God, and no one can tamper with it or change it, for the word of man does not resemble the divine word.
6. Every person is,, obliged to bear love for and submit to the imams and members of the family of the Prophet (may blessings be upon him and his family), [for] they are the heirs of the lessons of the Prophet; and the messenger, God's imam Mahdi (49) (greetings to him), who will come at the end of the world and fulfill the Shari'a of the Prophet in all the earth, belong to this group.
7. Once Almighty God entrusts us with an obligation, then whoever fulfills it, God will grant as a reward in [this] world contentment and nobility; at the Resurrection he will enter paradise, and whoever does not fulfill [this obligation] will be miserable and obscene in this world and at the Resurrection will be cast into hell.
8. The Resurrection is the day that God will raise up all people together from the dead and demand an accounting of all their actions.
9. Those who have done good will enter paradise, in order to dwell eternally in abundant gardens and enchanted palaces and will attain unending contentment.
10. Those who have done evil will be sent to hell so that in the course of the ages they will burn in a fearsome fire, dragons and scorpions will tear the flesh from their bodies and feed on it.
11. One of the duties established by God is the performance of the five ritual prayers, fulfillment of which is essential for the understanding of God.
12. Every day of the month of Ramadan it is necessary from dawn to dark to observe a fast in order to enter into the state of those who are hungry and to be charitable toward them.
13. It is necessary that rich people give to the poor the zakat and the khums (50) and alms, so that this will serve as a means of subsistence and a cause for the well-being of the life and property of others.
14. [1] [Ru only: After God, the Prophet and the imams] Hold your own parents more dear than anyone and whatever their pronouncements, do them and never offend them. [Cy inserts elipsis here in place of following sentence.] Those whose parents are not pleased with him, neither will Almighty God be pleased with them. Obey also your older brother and your paternal and maternal uncles. [Cy includes this last sentence with addition of "sister". AP is same as Ru.]
15. [2] Respect all those who are greater than you in duty [vazifa], learning or age so that those younger than you will respect you.
16. Show respect toward religious scholars, for the Prophet (upon whom be blessings) and the imams (upon whom be greetings) are not among us, and in the study of instructions of the Shari'a we must be in their [the scholars'] presence.
17. [3] Know that it is necessary for you to listen to heads of state; if it

were not for them, people would encroach upon each other's property, lives and honor and there could be no law and order in the country. [Cy reverses the order of the clauses so that "property, lives and honor" is last.]

18. [4] Whenever you are in any country, do not act-contrary to that region's laws so you will not be exposed to torment. [Tk:"be imprisoned."] [AP: "o yerinin kanunlari eleyhine isi gorme;" as opposed to Cy: "o vilayetin ganun-gaydalarina zidd is gorme."]
19. [5] Do not do any deed or speak any word from which no good will come in [this] world or in the next world, in order that you

- will not suffer damage (loss). [Tk: Do not do anything that is not for the good of the people (halk) nor speak any (such) word, so that no harm may come to you. (AP ends with slightly different phrasing ["sana ziyan deger" instead of "zerar yetiser"] and elipsis.)]
20. When you see a person who is unfortunate and helpless, do not laugh at him, for God can put you in the same position.
21. [6] Greet [Tk: selam ver- lit: wish peace] everyone that you encounter. If he says a[n offensive] word to you, listen and answer with civility so that all will love you. [AP: "answer with tact and 'tewazuOle,'" humility, submissiveness]
22. [7] Associate with those people that adults consider to be decent [Tk: good], stay far from the base and those who chatter [Tk: from those who talk baseness and nonsense], so that you will not become like them.
23. [8] When you see one in need, do not hold back, help the one in need to the extent you can, so that others will aid you when you are in need. [Tk versions omit opening phrase and begin with "Help..." AP: uses ihtiyac, Cy uses mohtaj. (51)]
24. [9] Do not tell anyone's faults to another, because if that person is your enemy, he will carry them to their destination. If it is a friend, he will [thereafter] have a bad opinion [Tk: be mistrustful] of you. [AP has slightly different wording: "haman adama catdirar... senin hakkinda pis fikre duser" as opposed to Cy "haman sozu sahibine catdirar... senin hakkinda badguman olar."]
25. [10] Avoid telling lies, because if everyone knows this characteristic [Cy: knows you as a liar], they will not believe the truth you speak either.
26. [11] If someone tells you the faults of another, stay far from him because he will tell your faults to others.
27. [12] If you have enmity toward someone, do not behave in such a way that if, one day, you become friends, you will be ashamed before him. [Tk: Do not make enemies with anyone, that one day if you make friends with him, you will be ashamed. Phrasing

differs slightly: AP: "dost olsa ondan utanasan; Cy: "onunla dost olsan utanarsan."]

28. [13] When a person becomes angry, he departs from reason. Do not do any work in that condition. Only begin after your anger has cooled!
- [AP for angry uses "ghazab" (Arabic) whereas Cy uses "hirs," which is also Arabic but in common use today in Azerbaijan. AP phrasing also differs: "keep yourself from work" ("ozunu her isten cekindir") and use of "icra eyile" to begin work again compared to Cy: "hie bir is gorme" and "ise basla," respectively.]
29. [14] Do not try to do a job that you have not been charged with because no good will come of it and you will fall behind in your own work. [AP: "DO not try to do a job that you have been charged with..." gives precisely the opposite meaning from Cy and Ru. The two Turkic transcriptions do not otherwise differ. There may be a technical error.]
30. [15] Fear laziness, it is the greatest shame. There is nothing more foul [Tk: worse] in the world than idleness. [AP: uses the phrase "it is worse than all other shames" and slightly different final phrasing. Both Turkic transcriptions use "issizlik" which I have translated as "idlenss" rather than "unemployment." Ru here uses "bezdere" or "idleness."]
31. [16] God created everything to maintain the world in order so that one thing cannot exist without other things. You too are one of those things. If you remain idle (issiz), stone and mud are better than you because they can be used to build a house. [AP agrees with Ru, with some rephrasing. Cy differs noticeably: In this world, everything was created for a purpose. One thing cannot live without being the help of another. You, too, are one of those, and if you remain unmarried, then stones and mud are better... AP uses "ev tikmeye yarayarlar" instead of Cy's "ev tikmek isinde kara gelirler."]
32. [17] Hold the increase of knowledge and education more dear than anything else because everything (else) is increased by the use of them. [Cy: Strive for learning and the education of the mind

above everything else because everything else is done with their help.]

33. [18] Do not do good to those who [AP: try to] do evil to others.

This constitutes good for the evil and evil for the good.

34. [19] Do not be quick to believe everything you hear. Perhaps the one who tells you something bears a grudge. Or, the one relaying the word did not clearly understand its meaning. Prove the word from other sources. [Cy ends: accordingly, investigate the words you hear from different sources.]

[AP: Do not believe everything you hear as soon as you hear it, for the person who speaks that very probable thing perhaps has a grudge or he himself is unaware of the truth of the matter. Try to learn from some other place whether the words you heard are true or not.]

35. [20] It often happens that when we are sure of a matter at one time, it later becomes known that the same matter has a different character. [AP and Ru are similar, Cy has slightly different wording and word order.]

36. [21] Do not get into the habit of joking and playing tricks [AP: playing tricks and making empty jokes] or you will look frivolous in the opinion of others and those of whom you made fun will take offense and think ill of you [Tk end here] and will make it their goal to do evil to you.

37. [22] If you triumph over someone in an argument, do not behave such that those around should know his ignorance. In that case, he will keep enmity in his heart toward you and at an appropriate moment take revenge. [AP and Ru are same. Cy: If you triumph over a man... do not try to display his ignorance to those around...]

38. [23] During a conversation, do not interfere with the speech of others! It is possible that a sly person will err and reveal his intent and (thus) an enemy will reveal something to your advantage. But if you talk much, your own inadequacies will be revealed. [Cy: ...sly person will err and display to you a truth you

are seeking. AP is roughly the same as Ru, but the language of both Tk versions is more ambiguous.]

39. [24] Well-being consists not in high position but in a good mood.

It often happens that a poor man finds [AP: by his (own) efforts] a morsel of bread and eats in peace [AP: with peace of mind; Cy: in peace and happiness], but the one who commands might is, from the turmoil of his affairs, plunged into confusion and fear. [Cy: Peace of mind is in the enjoyment of the circumstances, not in property, wealth and position... but the owner of wealth and luxury from the tangle of his own work lives in anxiety and torment (AP: torment and fear).] [AP uses mihnet and korku in this last line, where Cy uses mihnet and tesvis.]

40. [25] When some kind of disaster overtakes you, hope in God and

be patient; regret does not return that which was destroyed; because of that [regret], perhaps, you will fail to find out also about future matters. [Tk: If some misfortune befalls you, be hopeful, wait and be patient because to long for something that is lost, to regret, will not bring it back, [and] perhaps your anxiety and moaning (for things lost) will also cause you to fail to take precautions for (other) matters.] [AP: Final phrasing varies: izzirab ozunden gelecek islerin tedbirinden de gafil olarsan; compared to Cy: izzirab ve ahu-zarlik gelecek islerin tedbirini de elinden alar.]

41. [26] Do not tell others your misfortunes. If they are your enemies,

your misfortune serves as a cause for (their) mischief and for an increase in their power [Tk: they will mock you, be pleased and show their own strength]; if they are strangers, you will be lowered in their eyes [Tk: you will begin to appear unfortunate and worthless;] if they are your friends, it will be a cause for them to be sad and that too will stir up your grief [Tk: be a new trouble for you]. [AP: several words differ from Cy - for "misfortune," AP has "dert" instead of "musibet"; for "be sad," uses gamlanmak where Cy uses "kederlenmek." Instead of "appear unfortunate and worthless," AP has "fall from respect," "hurmetden dusmek."]

42. [27] Villainy in most cases produces result opposite those hoped for. [Tk: Bad character usually causes undesired results.] A miserly person lives in fear of being swindled. A haughty man appears base in the eyes of the people, an egotist is rebuked and people laugh at him. [AP: is afraid of being laughed at (but) becomes a laughing stock.] The man with a heavy-heart [Cy: hirsli, AP: azapli] is tormented because of other people's wrongs.
43. [28] Envy is a sign of talentlessness. A person who believes in his own talent tries to acquire more than others. An untalented (unable) person sees that he cannot improve and wishes that others too will fail to make them equal to himself. [Cy: If everyone believes in his own strength, he will try above everything else to obtain what he wants...] [AP: ...Those who believe in their own talents will be more successful than others... An untalented person, failing to meet with success wishes others too will fail....]
44. [29] There is no flame that burns worse than envy. An envious person can never live peacefully. His own sorrow and the joy of others are both troubles to him.
45. [30] A greedy and covetous person always complains and is troubled by scarcity because no matter how much wealth he gathers, it always seems insufficient.
46. [31] Do not rely on the kindness and humility of your enemy [Tk: Do not believe the (AP: humble and) friendly words of your enemy], perhaps he is deceiving you or if he is weak he is waiting for a suitable time.
47. [32] Do not suppose yourself to be talented with every compliment of others, perhaps they have a goal and they want to veil their aim with these compliments. [AP: first sentence has slightly different wording from Cy, e.g. for "suppose," gives "guman etmek" where Cy has "zenn etmek."]
48. [33] In every rank know your own limit, hold yourself neither lower nor higher than you should.

49. [34] Do not let people immediately find out about your affairs, for they are revealed by your tongue, both good and evil. In that case, refrain from setting forth your own confidential words. [Tk: The people will quickly learn your condition, from your own tongue they will learn whether you are in a good or bad state. Therefore, carefully mind your tongue (speech) and avoid saying things that are unnecessary!]
50. [35] Fulfill every task in accord with intellect and reason. If suddenly luck does not help it to come about, then you will remain in the world with the name of an expert of your own affairs. [Tk ends: ...if it does not bring luck at least you will be remembered by the world as one who knew. AP: slight variation on first phrase; instead of "intellect and reason" has (lit.) "with the support of your reason."]
51. [36] Do not deny the things you do not know and do not put too much faith even in [AP: do not be too sure of] the thing you know to be right, because our knowledge is still very little or our minds are in confusion. [Tk final phrase: "and our intellects are very poor."]
52. [37] The modest and sweet-tongued person has many friends.
53. [38] Lucky is he who has many friends. What could be better than the sharing of sorrow with another, the indication by him of your inadequacies and the rendering to you of help [when] in need? [Cy: A person with many friends is lucky, and moreover, when a calamity comes upon you, a friend is your companion to your trouble and shows your defect and helps you in need. [AP: ...what could be better than your friend's partnership in your troubles? ... in time of need extends a helping hand.]
54. [39] A person who is too tied to property and earthly love [Tk: loves the things of this world and hungrily searches, for a high position] cannot be fit for friendship, because he will always strive for his own benefit to the harm of another [Tk: and will try to harm others].

104

Audrey L. ALTSTADT

55. [40] In every task, turn for advise to those who know more than you and are guileless (without grudge). [AP reverses order.] One person's mind cannot be expert in every task.
56. [41] Do not compare the significance (merit) of a word with the circumstances under which it is spoken, there are times when the ignoramus says such a thing that surprises the shrewd [Cy: an ignoramus speaks such (AP: intelligent) words that the intelligent will be charmed], or the intelligent sometimes make such an error that the ignorant would not make.
57. [42] By doing good, you make a free man your slave. If you give trouble, with torment you drive away from yourself [your own (52)] slaves. [AP: By means of goodness, you can make a free, virtuous man a slave, but when you give trouble, slaves run from you. Cy ends: in their submission they will repudiate you. Also differences in words, e.g. "slave" is rendered as "bende" in AP and in Cy as "kul."]
58. [43] Avoid eating too much, because it is harmful to the health of your body and mind.
59. [44] Do not do all that your heart thirsts for, but do that which your mind demands because the mind chooses [AP: is able to distinguish] good and evil. [Tk begins: Do not indulge yourself, fulfill the desires of your mind....]
60. [45] There is no wealth better than mind and knowledge [Cy: above your intelligence and aspiration]. They are always with you and no one can take them from you.
61. [46] When you want to give advice to someone, if you want to give your expertise concerning his work, [do it] in secret [because if he is] in the company of other people he will not accept it and may be offended by you.
62. [47] Whatever promise you make, try to fulfill it, that another time if you again make a promise, others will believe that it too you will fulfill. [AP: final wording different in use of "icra etmek" for "fulfill" unlike Cy "yerine yetirmek."]
63. [48] As much as possible do not accept things which another gives [Cy: do not take loans or things from another] because in his eyes you will seem base and to you he will seem great.
64. [49] Do not put off until tomorrow a task that you see today, perhaps tomorrow you will not be able to do it.
65. [50] Make piety your motto; whoever commits amoral offenses, loses faith and shame, and he will be dishonored in the eyes of the people. [Tk begins: Make **Tightness** your motto, if everyone abandons himself to "crookedness," (AP: his) shame and faith leave...]
66. [51] If you know a person's flaws, try to conceal them, so that God will cover your flaws. [AP: When you see the flaws and evils of another, do not try to divulge them... Cy: ...try not to spread them...]
67. [52] When there is the probability that there is good, do not construe a person's actions as bad, perhaps it was advisable and you still do not appreciate its use(fulness). [AP: its real nature. Cy: its meaning].
68. [53] A person is famous not for his linneage but for his personal achievements. A worthy son does not need a high birth [lit: descent], a degenerate is a disgrace to [his] family. [Cy: A person's honor is according to his own talent and not his lineage. Intelligent progeny have no need of lineage, worthless progeny destroy the lineage's name. AP varies slightly from Cy.]
69. [54] That which you consider to be bad for yourself do not employ with relation to others, so that recompense (retribution) for it will not be ascribed (fall) to you. [Tk: What you do not regard as permissible

(reva gormemek) for yourself, do not regard as permissible for another,
that otherwise you will receive punishment from some other [person].]

70. [55] Inasmuch as people of all religions, even the idolworshippers,
believe in a retribution for the commission of sins, whatever good or
evil you do to another you do to yourself. [Tk: Every religion, even
Buddhism, has such good beliefs as: every desire

has its punishment. Whatever good or evil you do to anyone you are doing to yourself.]

71. [56] When uttering any word or performing any act, do not be certain that you are alone and no one knows about you; it is very possible that [the act] will be found out; likewise it will [then] be believed that every act which is committed [by you] is bad, and [you will be] quickly disgraced. [Tk: If you speak every word or execute every action in secret, do not be assured that you are in seclusion [alone, unobserved] and another will not know this [word or act]. It often happens that those words or that effort will be revealed and you will be dishonored.]
72. [57] Do not wish anyone ill, be honorable in matters of commerce [lit: sale and purchase]; do not encroach on that which has been entrusted to you, so that you will not fall into the wrath of God and will not be cursed by the people. [Tk: Do not do harm to anyone, be pure on your own account (for your own sake?), do not abuse your trusts (things entrusted to you) that ... (elipsis in Cy text, none in AP.) that the people will turn away from you.]
73. [58] Be kind to your relatives and to those people attached to them and [AP: try to] help them, that they will also be kind to you.
74. [59] Behave well toward your neighbors and those around you so that they behave toward you in a like manner. You are one and they are many [and] it is clear that the one [lone person] is in need of the many. [Tk: Show goodness and get along (Cy: "mudara," suggests feigned friendship; AP has "yahsi davran," "behave well") with your neighbors and the local people that they will show friendship [here both texts use "mudara"] to you. Know that you are one and they are many... [elipsis in Cy text, none in AP.] That the lone person must be cautious toward the many is obvious.]
75. [60] Avoid [people] with a foul character and bad nature, for [this] ruins all the beauty of morals. A person of bad nature suffers from his own temper, to say nothing of [suffering from] other people. [Cy: Beware of those with a bad character and of the quality of having a bad character, for they spoil good morals]

(AP: good character will- come to nought); a person with bad character, inflicts pain upon himself (AP: wilt suffer from his own character), so what can he expect from the people. (In some passages wording differs, e.g. for "bad character," AP uses "bedmizac" where Cy gives "pis hasiyyet.")]

76. [61] In doing good to anyone, neither openly nor by signs obligate him for the aid you rendered, or the value of the good will be lost and injury will proliferate in place of kindness. [AP: ...do not by innuendo hang an obligation around his neck...the importance of the good is lost and in place of pleasantness, grief will blossom.]
77. [62] That person is considered intelligent who sees his own faults more than those of others and attaches less importance to his own skills than to those of others. [Cy: ...knows little of his own capabilities.]
78. [63] If someone does a wrong to you, be a bit patient and rid yourself of it with mildness. If there is no other alternative than to answer his wrong, do only a like measure, to repel his evil, and no more. [Cy: If someone injures you, respond with self-restraint; if you must respond in kind, be rid of his wrong only and give no further trouble.]
79. [64] Seek friendship as much as possible because from hostility only regret is born. [Cy: Try to earn as many friends as possible because enmity multiplies regret.]
80. [65] Do not suppose any enemy to be powerless, it is probable that he has a powerful friend or has ties with men of ability ["or has ties..." lacking in Cy] and they will help him.
81. [66] Do not keep hatred in your heart for another that your own peace of heart and trust [Cy: peace of mind] will be lost. [AP: different words, e.g. for "hatred" uses "adavet" where Cy uses "kin," for "heart" uses "yurek" where Cy uses "kalb" and final phrase (lit.) is "your heart's peace will be lost."]
82. [67] When you hear from someone something bad about yourself, immediately express yourself to him; you will understand the truth or falsity of the words you heard from his behavior. [AP: When you hear that someone has spoken badly of you, do not be

quick to confront that person with these words, the truth or correctness of the words will be known to you through that one's actions and speech.] [Cy: If someone reported unfavorably of you, do not confront the individual who has done this,...]

83. [68] Make use of the fortune (means) given to you by God in this world and the next. The person who hoards deprives himself of [his] fortune for [it, i.e. the fortune] is easily lost or is passed on to heirs. [Tk: Wealth you gather is for spending in this world and the next. If every one were miserly ["hasis;" AP: "pahil"] and hoarded wealth, they would deprive themselves of (the pleasure of) this wealth because either it will perish from some event or will be left to the descendents.] [AP: for "the good in the next world," gives "ahiret menafi'ini," where Cy gives "ahiret isleri."]
84. [69] When spending wealth, one should not squander it, so that, from unskillful expenditures, it will not be lost to a use for which it was expected. [Cy: Because it might not be available when you need to spend it in a more needed place.]
85. [70] When you do wrong, no benefit will accrue from it. Instead

- you will be left with sin and a bad name. [Cy: A wicked act will never do you good, but will leave you with a bad name. For "bad name," AP uses "badnamelik" where Cy uses "pis ad." Tk versions omit "sin"]
86. [71] A person derives pleasure twice from a good action: first when one performs it, second when one is repaid for it.
87. [72] Since everything in the world is doomed to destruction, do not attach yourself [AP: soil yourself by firm attachment] to anything so that when it suddenly is destroyed, your life will not be unbearable [AP: because when it meets decline you will suffer torment]. [Cy: Inasmuch as it is true that nothing in the world is eternal. With every thing that is destroyed, do not make yourself suffer... (elipsis in Cy text.)]
88. [73] Do not destroy your life with matters that you will later have to abandon. [AP: slight wording differences: "terk etmek" for "abandon" where Cy has "el cekmek."]
89. [74] Have patience when you are preparing a task, but hurry in the execution! For much time is needed to understand the value of a task, for its fulfillment an appropriate moment is enough. [AP: Think well (carefully?) when you take on a task (Cy: Do not hurry in the planning of a task) and then do not neglect its fulfillment, because in order to comprehend a task much time is necessary, but to execute it, (one) opportunity is sufficient (Cy: but little [time is needed] for its accomplishment).]
90. [75] Do not complain of poverty or misfortune, for in this world there are many [Tk: those] in greater poverty or misfortune than you, and if they were like you (in a like situation), they would consider themselves fortunate... [Italics in Cy text, but not in AP.]
91. The world was created by God in accord with rules and order. All people in it cannot be equal, just as in one body the ear cannot manage that which is demanded of the eye, the hand cannot do what the mouth does. God created each [of these] in one form which is necessary for its appointed task.
92. Similarly, as people are distinguished by [external] figure and voice, [they] are distinguished also by their knowledge and morals. Inasmuch as we know the Sovereign of the world to be wise, there is no place for reproach in the fact that for some reason He made one person this way and another that way.
93. [76] When some job you have done does not yield the result you wanted, check to see [AP: think over] whether the fault lies with yourself. Often we do not fulfill the affairs according to the dictates of the mind and later blame others [Tk: Often it happens that we do not conduct our affairs with reason and then blame others... (Cy and AP texts end here with elipsis)], and worst of all, thinking God a hindrance to usefull affairs, we say "God did not provide."
94. [77] It is necessary to observe moderation in all circumstances. Both extravagance and miserliness are evil. Although gentleness is the best of morals, even anger has its own place. Consequently, the intelligent one is the one who always, in all

circumstances, maintains moderation. [Tk: It is necessary always to observe temperateness. If we give free rein to miserliness and waste, we will see no good. Even with kindness and a wonderful character, sometimes anger is accepted [beyenilir] in its place. That means the intelligent person is one who, in all matters, adopts temperateness.]

95. [78]■ Do not try to save a guilty person from a justly given punishment, because others dare to do evil deeds and to torment the poor. [AP ends: doing so will embolden others to do wrong and will create trouble for the pitiable.] [Cy: Do not try to cause reconciliation to a guilty person, because when you do, this will embolden wicked people and trouble the weak.]
96. [79] If one whom you know to be blameless is unjustly punished, by every means [AP: to the extent possible] save him from calamity and slander [Tk versions end here] so that God will consider others in obligation to give you help in calamity.
97. [80] That person is called unlucky who, even when he is able, does not do good to others. [Tk end here] Meanwhile, after the rendering of good it is necessary [for the recipient?] sincerely to give a blessing, that it turns out to the benefactors to be of the same essence as he himself. (?) [AP: different phrasing, e.g. "enden gelmek" for "able" where Cy has "bacarmak."
98. Without deeds and merits in vain one hopes for the benefits of God, for to give undeservedly means to give in error.
99. [81] In all your tasks, supervise their fulfillment yourself, because no one will hold your profit above his own good. Besides that, since there are various kinds of "precisions" it is very difficult for another to be able to fulfill in every way the task at the same level that you want.
100. [82] It is not possible to do a job that requires help without that help. Because, one person cannot do every job alone, perhaps he will be occupied with the details and forget the important aspects. In other words it is necessary when you delegate any task to another to oversee how he fulfills it.

101. [83] Take on work according to your own strength and talent, not simply according to your desires. It often happens that a person runs after much but produces little.
102. [84] Do good to every person according to his own condition, for a small thing suits someone according to his taste more than a significant

- thing. [Cy: for it often happens that an insignificant thing more often than a big thing accrues to a person's benefit.]
103. Although in affairs we have our own will, still if God does not wish it, then we can do nothing. Therefore it is necessary, in order that we ourselves take appropriate measures and beneficially fulfill them, that we petition the Sovereign of the world. God knows the truth and to Him is restitution.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abbaskuluaga Bakykhanov Gudsi (Baku: Yaziji, 1982) Azerbaijan Academy of Sciences, A. K. Bakikhanov; Sochineia (Baku: Elm, 1983) Muriel Alkin, Russia and Iran 1700-1828 (Minneapolis: U Minesota Press, 1980) Audrey Altstadt "The Forgotten Factor: The Shii Mullahs of Revolutionary Baku" Passe Turco-Tatar, Present Svetique: Etudes offertes a Alexandre Bennigsen. Ch. Lemercier Quelquejay, G. Veinstein, S.E. Wimbush, Eds. (Paris, 1986) Audrey Altstadt, "Azerbaijani Turks; Resistance to Russian Conquest" Studies in Comparative Communism XIX nos 3/4 1986 Azerbaijan Kitabi V.I 1780-1920 (Baku, 1963) Helene Carrere d'Encausse, Decline of an Empire (New York, 1981) Firoudin Kocherli, Azerbaijan Edebiyyati Tarikhi Materiallari (Baku, 1925) Martin Dewhurst and Robert Farrell, Eds. The Soviet Censorship (Metuschen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1973) Murray Feschbach "Trends in the Soviet Muslim Pupulation: Demographic Aspects" Yaacov Ro'i Ed., The USSR and the Muslim World (London, 1984) A. Guseinov, et. al. Istoriia Azerbaijana (Baku: 1958-1963) Edward Ingram, The Beginning of the Great Game in Asia 1828-1834 (Oxford, 1979) Komsomol'skaia Pravda December 1984 H. B. Paksoy, Alpamysh: Central Asian Identity under Russian Rule (Hartford, CT: AACAR, 1989) H. B. Paksoy, "The Deceivers" Central Asian Survey Vol. 3 No. 3 (1983) Hugh Seton-Watson, The Russian Empire 1801-1917 (Oxford, 1967) N. Tairzade "O musulmanskikh uchilischchak v Azerbaidzhane v kontse 40-x v 50-e gody XIX v" Azerbaijan Tarihine dair materyallar (Baku, 1962) Talat Tekin, A Grammar of Orkhon Turkic (Bloomington, Indiana, 1968)

Xü lasə

ABBASQULU AĞA BAKIXANLININ NƏSİHƏTLƏRİ

Audrey L. ALTSTADT
(Massachusetts Universitəsi, Amherst, ABŞ)

Abbasqulu ağa Bakixanlı (1794-1846) tapıxçı, filosof, pedaqoq və tər-cüməçi olmuşdur. Onun "Nəsihətlər " əsəri ancaq Sovet idarəçiliyi altında qismən öyrənilmiş, Qərbdə isə heç tanınmamışdır.

4 Bu məqalədə "Nəsihətlər" in mövcud üç nəşri öyrənilmiş və ingi-liscəyə tam tərcümə edilmişdir.

Abbasqulu ağa Bakixanlının "Nəsihətləri" nin Azərbaycan mədəniyyə-tiniin inkişafı tarixində öz yeri vardır. Bu əsər Azərbaycanın Rusiya tərəfin-dən işğalından sonrakı dövrün ilk mə'nəviyyat toplusu kimi çox qiymətlidir.

Bakixanlı təhsilin əsaslan və praktik tərəfləri ilə çox ciddi məşğul olmuşdur. Əslində, "Nəsihətlər" onun 1832-33-cü illərdə yazılmış "Təhzibi ül- əxlaq" əsərinin əsas müddəalan ilə çox bağlıdır.

Bakixanlının ən vacib fikirlərindən biri yenitipli məktəblərin qurulma-sı layihəsi idi. Müəllifin sağhğında çap olunmasa da, Azərbaycanda təhsil sisteminin yeniləşməsində Bakixanlının ideyaları mühüm rol oynadı.

Bakixanlı 1794 -cü il iyulun 21-də (Qrigorian təqviminə görə iyulun 3-də) Bakı ətrafındakı Əmircan qəsəbəsində anadan olmuşdur. O, Bakı xanı II Mirzə Məhəmməd xanın oğlu idi. Azərbaycanın Rusiya tərəfindən işğahndan sonra Mirzə Məhəmməd xanın altı oğlu Rusiyada hərbi xid-mətdə və ya Abbasqulu ağa kimi tərcüməçi vəzifəsində çahşmışdır.

Abbasqulu ağa şəriətdən, fars, ərəb dilləri və ədəbiyyatından təhsil almış, sonralar rus dilini öyrənmişdir.

Bakixanlı fəlsəfə, tarix, Bakı və Dərbənd tarixləri də daxil olmaqla, astronomiya, riyaziyyat, pedaqogika, fars dili qramatikası üzrə iri elmi əsərlər, həmçinin şe'rlər və bədii nümunələr yazmışdır.

O, 1837-ci ildə baş vermiş Quba üsyanı haqqmda hesabat yazmış, sonralar bu barədə dövlətə öz e'tirazını bildirmişdir.

Bakixanlı 1846-cı ildə həccə getmiş və orada vəba xəstəliyinə tutu-laraq, vəfat etmişdir.

Rusiyanın rəsmi millətlər doktrinasına görə, Qafqazda ruslaşdırma və xristianlaşdırma müstəmləkə siyasəti apanhrdı. Məsələn, missionerlər xris-tianlıqı və

rus dilini tədris edən məktəblər açıldılar. Lakin onlar bu işdə əsaslı uğur qazana bilmədilər. Digər tip məktəblər siyasi və ictimai baxım

dan daha uyğun idi. "Rus- tatar" məktəbi adlanan ilk təhsil ocaqları Qafqazın şərq bölgələrində: 1830- Şuşada, 1831- Nuxada, 1832- Bakıda, 1833-Gəncədə, 1837- ci illərdə Şamaxı və Naxçıvanda yaradılırdı.

1982 və 1983-də Bakıda "Nəsihətlər" in iki nəşri (üç dildə və üç əlifbada) həyata keçirildi. Birinci kütləvi nəşr, ikinci isə Azərbaycan Elm-lər Akademiyasının rusca elmi nəşri idi. Bu nəşrlər və tərcümələrdə çoxlu fərqlər və nöqsanlar vardı.

Bizim aşağıda verdiyimiz ingiliscəyə tərcümədə hər nəsihət iki mənbədən: birincisi rusçaya tərcümədən, ikincisi (məntəzədəki) türkcəyə tərcümədən götürülmüşdür.

Məqaləmizdə kiril və ərəb qrafikası ilə verilmiş iki türk variantı, rus və türk tərcümələri arasındakı fərqlər ətrafı araşdırılır.

Bakıxanlı öz nəsihətlərində türk-islam və islamdan öncəki türk ənənə-lərinə əsaslanır. Burada Sənai, Hafız və Rumi kimi sufi şairlərlə yanaşı, Balasaqunlu Yusifin 1069- cu ildə yazdığı "Kutadqu bilik" əsərinin ideyanı mühüm yer tutur. Hətta Orxon yazılıının təsiri də görünür. Ümumiyyətlə, "Nəsihətlər"in fəlsəfəsində islam ünsürlərindən daha çox türk ünsürləri üstündür.

Biz, əlbəttə, Bakıxanlının "Kutadqu bilik" əsərini oxuyub-oxumadığını bilmirik. Orxon yazılan isə o dövrdə kəşf olunmamışdı. Biz yalnız ideya, fikir, fəlsəfi baxımdan nəsihətlərin həmin türk mənbələrinə yaxınlıq ideyasını irəli sürürük.